The Processes and Effectiveness of Online Counselling and Therapy for Young People

Mitchell J. Dowling

University of Canberra
Faculty of Health

Primary Supervisor: Professor Debra Rickwood

A thesis by published works submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Clinical Psychology

June 2015
Abstract

This thesis by published works contributes to knowledge of the processes and effectiveness of online individual synchronous chat counselling. Through a series of qualitative and quantitative studies it explores the implementation of eheadspace, a youth focussed online mental health service for young Australians aged 12 to 25 years. The goal of the research was to further investigate this relatively under-researched treatment modality to identify factors that may affect treatment outcomes and thereby improve online counselling for young Australians.

The research used a sequential exploratory mixed methods design comprising five studies, including: a systematic review of the literature; a qualitative analysis of online clinician experiences; a cross-sectional study of online youth clients; a six-week pre- and post-test of client treatment outcomes; and a mixed qualitative/quantitative analysis of the relationship between counselling processes and treatment outcomes.

Study 1 was a systematic review of the literature that aimed to identify previous studies regarding the effectiveness of online counselling. The main finding of the systematic review was that only six previous studies had examined the effectiveness of online chat, producing mixed, but generally positive, results of effectiveness.

Study 2 was a qualitative exploration of 19 online clinicians’ experiences of providing mental health care online. The aim of the study was to develop hypotheses regarding processes and effectiveness by exploring the experiences of online clinicians. This study found that online clinicians described performing various roles and using a variety of skills online, but favoured person-centred techniques.

Study 3 was a cross-sectional analysis of 1,033 online youth clients aged 16 to 25 years. The study aimed to identify the characteristics of young people who seek help from eheadspace. The main findings of the study were that online clients reported high levels of
psychological distress, low levels of life satisfaction, and low levels of hope, but held high expectations of treatment outcome.

Study 4 investigated six-week treatment outcomes for 152 clients, and aimed to examine the effectiveness of online counselling. After six weeks, psychological distress and life satisfaction were shown to be not significantly affected by the amount of online counselling received nor by having sought additional treatment. However, those who attended one or more online sessions reported significantly higher levels of hope six weeks later compared with those with no online counselling.

The fifth study analysed and rated the progress and depth of counselling from a sample of 49 session transcripts. This study aimed to determine the psychotherapy activities and processes used in online counselling for young people and how these related to client outcomes. This study found that online clinicians generally did not progress through all the stages of counselling in any great depth, but did find an association between greater progress and depth and improved treatment outcomes.

This thesis contributes significantly to our understanding of online counselling for young people. It is one of few comprehensive studies of an online service that explores online clinicians’ experiences, client characteristics, treatment processes, and treatment outcomes. The results extend knowledge of how to improve the provision of mental health care online. Based on the research findings a brief online chat counselling model is proposed. The implications of the findings for online clinicians and online service delivery, and future directions for research, are discussed.
List of Papers for PhD by Published Works

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Paper</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Experiences of counsellors providing online chat counselling to young people.</td>
<td>Dowling, M., &amp; Rickwood, D. (2014)</td>
<td>Published</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Exploring hope and expectations in the youth mental health online counselling environment.</td>
<td>Dowling, M., &amp; Rickwood, D. (2014)</td>
<td>Accepted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Computers in Human Behavior, x(x), x-x.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Psychotherapy and Counselling Research, x(x), 1-10. doi: 10.1002/capr.12037</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Investigating individual online synchronous chat counselling processes and treatment outcomes for young people.</td>
<td>Dowling, M., &amp; Rickwood, D. (2014)</td>
<td>Published</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Advances in Mental Health, 12(3), 216-224.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Conference Presentations During PhD Candidature

International Conferences

Australian Conferences
Acknowledgements

There are a number of people that I would like to thank for their assistance and support throughout my PhD candidature. First and foremost, I would like to thank my primary supervisor, Professor Debra Rickwood, whose guidance and expertise has been invaluable over this time. I am enormously grateful for her ongoing commitment and encouragement.

I would also like to acknowledge Professor Tim Carey who encouraged me to undertake the PhD and has offered his support throughout. Dr. Peter Chamberlain and Dr. Janie Busby-Grant have also been of great help aiding me prepare my thesis for examination.

My thanks also go to Gemma Henshall for proof reading my thesis for errors, and for generally being wonderful and generous. Dr. Matthew Marshall also deserves to be acknowledged for his efforts to improve my grammar.

Thank you also to my fellow PhD candidates of clinical psychology at the University of Canberra, especially Sally Bradford and Ben Kwan, whose friendship and collegial support has been much appreciated. I would also like to thank my friends who have undertaken this journey with me and provided great assistance.

Finally, I would like to thank my wonderful family for their support. Without the unwavering encouragement and assistance of my parents, Peter and Frankie, I would not have been able to complete this thesis.
Table of Contents

Abstract i
Declaration iii
List of Papers for PhD by Published Works v
Conference Presentations During PhD Candidature vii
Acknowledgments ix
Table of Contents xi
List of Tables xix
List of Figures xxi

Chapter 1: Overview 1
   A. Contribution of the thesis as a whole 1
   B. Rationale: Need for this research 1
   C. Aim of the thesis 2
   D. Structure of the thesis 2

Chapter 2: Introduction 5
   A. Chapter introduction 5
   B. Youth mental health and wellbeing 5
      a. Prevalence 5
      b. Impact 6
   C. Help-seeking 7
   D. Entering the e-spectrum 9
   E. Types and definitions of online mental health interventions 13
      a. Online counselling and therapy 14
      b. Web-based interventions 14
      c. Internet-operated therapeutic software 15
d. Other online activities

F. Effectiveness of online interventions

G. Development and acceptance of individual synchronous online chat counselling

H. The efficacy and effectiveness of online chat
   a. Online versus telephone
   b. Online versus face-to-face
   c. Online versus control
   d. Satisfaction

I. Strengths and benefits of online chat
   a. Greater access
   b. Disinhibition and disclosure
   c. Safe environment
   d. Authority/power
   e. The benefit of writing in counselling
   f. Gateways to mental health support

J. Concerns and barriers of online chat
   a. Loss of verbal and non-verbal cues and the dehumanization of the therapeutic bond
   b. Toxic disinhibition
   c. Time
   d. Technical difficulties
   e. Suitability for crisis intervention and/or serious disorders
   f. Ethical considerations
K. Factors affecting online chat treatment outcomes 35
   a. Client variables 36
   b. Therapeutic relationship 38
   c. Placebo, hope and expectancy factors 39
   d. Techniques and processes 41

L. Chapter summary and rationale for current research 42
   a. eheadspace 43

M. Aims 44

Chapter 3: Extended Methodology 45
   A. Chapter introduction 45
   B. Research design 45
   C. Ethics 46
   D. Study 1 47
   E. Study 2 49
   F. Study 3 51
   G. Study 4 54
   H. Study 5 56
   I. Chapter summary 57

Chapter 4: Online Counselling and Therapy for Mental Health Problems: A Systematic Review of Individual Synchronous Interventions Using Chat 59
   A. Study 1. Chapter introduction 59
   B. Declaration for thesis chapter 59
   C. Abstract 61
   D. Background 61
E. Method 69
F. Results 70
G. Discussion 75
H. References 77

Chapter 5: Experiences of Counsellors Providing Online Chat Counselling to Young People.
A. Study 2. Chapter introduction 83
B. Declaration for thesis chapter 83
C. Abstract 85
D. Background 85
E. Method 87
F. Results 89
G. Discussion 93
H. References 96

Chapter 6: Exploring Hope and Expectations in the Youth Mental Health Online Counselling Environment.
A. Study 3. Chapter introduction 99
B. Declaration for thesis chapter 99
C. Abstract 101
D. Background 101
E. Method 105
F. Results 108
G. Discussion 112
H. References 118

Chapter 7: A Naturalistic Study of the Effects of Synchronous Online Chat
Counselling on Young People’s Psychological Distress, Life Satisfaction, and Hope

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Study 4. Chapter introduction</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Declaration for thesis chapter</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Background</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Method</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Results</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Discussion</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>References</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Chapter 8: Investigating Individual Online Synchronous Chat Counselling</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Processes and Treatment Outcomes for Young People</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Study 5. Chapter introduction</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Declaration for thesis chapter</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Background</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Method</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Results</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Discussion</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>References</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Chapter 9: Discussion</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Chapter introduction</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Summary of findings</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Study 1</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Study 2</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
c. Study 3 163
d. Study 4 165
e. Study 5 166

C. The effectiveness of online chat 167

D. Factors affecting online chat treatment outcomes 167
   a. Client variables 168
      i. Gender disparity 168
      ii. Number of sessions attended 170
      iii. Additional help-seeking 172
      iv. Presenting problems 174
   b. Placebo, hope and expectancy factors 175
      i. Hope 175
      ii. Expectations 177
      iii. Incongruent hope and expectations 178
   c. Techniques and processes 181
   d. Therapeutic relationship 183

E. Implications for online clinicians 184
   a. Time constraints 185
   b. Attrition 189
   c. Role clarity 192

F. Brief online chat counselling intervention 194
   a. Proposed brief online chat counselling model 195
      i. Orientation 197
      ii. Problem clarification 198
      iii. Goal exploration 199
iv. Action planning 199

v. Termination 200

G. Social policy implications 201

H. Strengths and limitations 202

I. Future research directions 206

J. Conclusion 208

References 209

Appendix A: Ethical Approval 237

Appendix B: Participant Complaint Form 239

Appendix C: Focus Group Participant Information and Consent Form 241

Appendix D: Online Questionnaire 243

Appendix E: Six-Week Follow-Up 251

Appendix F: Counselling Progress Rating Instrument Manual 257
### List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Systematic Review Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Types of Psychological Services Provided Online</td>
<td>64-65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Study Characteristics</td>
<td>71-73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Domain, Themes, and Illustrative Quotes</td>
<td>90-91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Mean Scores (Standard Deviation) for Measures by Gender, Age,</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>and Location</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Intercorrelations for Scores of Hope, Expectations, Psychological</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Distress, and Life Satisfaction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Number and Percentage of Participants Who Sought Adjunct Treatment</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>by Online Sessions Attended</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>Mean Scores and Standard Deviations by Number of Sessions</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>Intercorrelations for Scores of Pre-Hope, Expectations, Psychological</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Distress Change, Life Satisfaction Change and Hope Change</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>Summary Statistics for Progress and Depth Subscales According to Number</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>of Sessions Attended</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>Pre-, Post-, and Change Mean Scores and Standard Deviations for</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Treatment Outcomes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>Intercorrelations Between Change Scores in Treatment Outcomes</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>and Progress and Depth of Counselling Processes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>Summarised Steps of the Brief Online Chat Counselling Model</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Figures

Figure 2.1  12-month prevalence estimates of mental illness in the Australian population by severity level, based on diagnosis, disability, and chronicity.  

Figure 2.2  The ‘e-spectrum’ of interventions for youth mental health.  

Figure 3.1  Sequential exploratory mixed methods design.  

Figure 3.2  PRISMA Diagram for systematic review.  

Figure 7.1  Distribution of number of counselling sessions.  

Figure 7.2  Hope scores over time by amount of counselling.