Is tourism education meeting the needs of the tourism industry?

An Australian case study

Jie Wang

March 2008

Thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Arts in Tourism (Research)
at the University of Canberra, Australian Capital Territory, Australia
ABSTRACT

Despite the rapid growth in the provision of tourism higher education in the past 40 years, uncertainties remain about the content and nature of tourism degrees and how these are aligned with the needs of the tourism industry. Some research has been done on tourism higher education curriculum design, but the extent to which tourism higher education meets industry needs has not yet been closely investigated. This study aims to ascertain whether a gap exists between what education institutions provide in their undergraduate curricula in the way of tourism knowledge and skills sets, and what knowledge and skills sets are required by the tourism industry.

A conceptual framework was developed to outline the research process, which involved two steps. First, content analysis of tourism curricula was conducted as the preliminary research. A list of 34 subject areas was synthesised from all core subjects offered in tourism courses in a sample of Australian universities according to subjects’ titles, themes and detailed descriptions. A list of 27 skills and abilities was identified by collating university generic skills and tourism discipline attributes from these institutions. Based on the study of tourism curricula, two web-based surveys were then designed and distributed in order to investigate the respective perceptions of industry professionals and academic providers on the subjects and skills sets necessary for tourism employment.

In analysing the data, perceptions about the subjects and skills sets were compared between tourism industry professionals and academic providers. Importance-performance analysis, gap analysis, and SPSS statistical tools were applied to analyse this data.

The study found considerable variance between the views of industry professionals and academic providers in Australia. Their views vary firstly on the relative value of tertiary degrees for tourism professionals; secondly, on the relative merits of skills and abilities needed to work in the tourism sector; and thirdly, on the relative merits of various subjects taught at university. These findings establish the existence of a gap between the existing tourism curriculum at university level, and the needs of the tourism industry. The findings of this study also provide evidence to suggest that tourism higher education provision should not
be isolated from real practice and that those involved in curriculum design should work closely with industry representatives to ensure a strong connection between theory and practice, thus improving the likelihood that graduates of tourism higher education courses will graduate with knowledge and skills sets which are closely aligned with the needs and expectations of the tourism industry.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Hearty acknowledgments are due to my supervisory panel: Dr Jeremy Huyton for his encouraging and incisive insight and direction throughout the entire process; Dr Helen Ayres, whose attention to detail has assisted me in being more disciplined about my approach to this work; and Dr Brent Ritchie for his advice and encouragement.

My thanks must also go to the Academic Skills Program at the University of Canberra (UC): Dr Joelle Vandermensbrugghe, Dr Linda Li and Dr Kate Wilson. Their support and advice on a range of issues that arose in developing this paper was invaluable. Thanks also go to Dr David Peterson for his professional advice about statistical analysis in this study. I wish to thank the Centre for Tourism Research at UC, particularly Pam Faulks for supporting the development and deployment of the survey, and Dr Tracey Dickson for her advice about data analysis.

I would like to thank the International Centre of Excellence in Tourism and Hospitality Education (THE-ICE) and UC for providing me with such an invaluable scholarship. This opportunity has engendered in me a broad international vision. Thanks to Dr Perry Hobson for his encouragement, Jane Malady for her meritorious assistance, Pauline Tang and Liz Fredline. Thanks to the Sustainable Tourism Co-operative Research Centre (STCRC) for distributing the surveys via their newsletter and to all participants in the survey research.

Thanks to my many friends, particularly Deborah White, a person with many years experience in HR across the public, private and university sectors.

Finally, I would especially like to thank my mother, Xiaowei, and my father, Yaozhong, who have taught me to stand on my feet, and my husband, Xiaochun, who has added meaning to my life and contributed to this thesis greatly. Without their love, support and understanding, I would not have been in a position to complete this research.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF FIGURES .................................................................................................................. VI
LIST OF TABLES ..................................................................................................................... VII
APPENDIXES .......................................................................................................................... VIII
ABBREVIATIONS .................................................................................................................... IX

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION ................................................................................................. 1

1.1 Background of the study ................................................................................................. 2
  1.1.1 The need for qualified employees in the tourism industry in Australia .................... 2
  1.1.2 The provision of undergraduate tourism education in Australia .............................. 3
1.2 Statement of research problem ....................................................................................... 5
1.3 Research aim and research questions ............................................................................ 6
1.4 Significance of the study ............................................................................................... 6
1.5 Definitions of important terms ..................................................................................... 8
1.6 Method, scope and assumptions .................................................................................. 9
1.7 Structure of this study .................................................................................................. 11
1.8 Summary ...................................................................................................................... 12

CHAPTER 2 LITERATURE REVIEW .................................................................................... 13

2.1 Curriculum definition .................................................................................................... 13
2.2 Curriculum theory and curriculum theorising ............................................................ 15
  2.2.1 The development of curriculum work ...................................................................... 15
  2.2.2 Curriculum theorising ............................................................................................ 17
  2.2.3 Curriculum models .................................................................................................. 17
2.3 Curriculum of tourism management ............................................................................. 19
  2.3.1 Vocational characteristics of tourism curriculum ..................................................... 19
  2.3.2 Tourism curriculum research .................................................................................. 20
  2.3.3 Curriculum model for tourism higher education ..................................................... 23
  2.3.4 Debates in tourism curriculum design .................................................................... 24
2.4 Tourism employment and education needs for the tourism industry ......................... 27
  2.4.1 Status of tourism employment and related literature .............................................. 27
  2.4.2 Identifying education needs for the tourism industry ............................................. 29
2.5 Curriculum decision: what knowledge is of most worth? ........................................ 31
2.6 All waste is due to isolation? ....................................................................................... 32
2.7 Summary ...................................................................................................................... 33

CHAPTER 3 CONCEPTUALISATION AND METHODOLOGY ........................................... 34

3.1 Conceptualisation: A framework for gap investigation .............................................. 34
3.2 Content analysis of tourism curricula ......................................................................... 36
  3.2.1 Content analysis of tourism subjects ..................................................................... 38
  3.2.2 Collation of skills and abilities .............................................................................. 51
3.3 Application of the conceptual framework .................................................................. 54
  3.3.1 Research paradigm and approach ......................................................................... 54
  3.3.2 Survey method ....................................................................................................... 55
  3.3.3 Sample design ....................................................................................................... 56
  3.3.4 Questionnaire design ............................................................................................ 60
3.4 Data collection ............................................................................................................. 63
3.5 Data analysis ................................................................................................................. 67
  3.5.1 Importance-performance analysis .......................................................................... 68
  3.5.2 Gap analysis .......................................................................................................... 69
3.6 Ethical issues ................................................................................................................ 71
3.7 Limitations of the study ............................................................................................. 71
3.8 Summary ...................................................................................................................... 72
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2-1: A curriculum for the philosophic practitioner .....................................................23
Figure 3-1: Model of gap analysis between tourism curriculum and tourism industry needs........35
Figure 3-2: Tourism, knowledge and the curriculum .............................................................46
Figure 3-3: Gap analysis in a service quality model..............................................................69
Figure 3-4: Gap analysis in tourism education.................................................................70
Figure 4-1: Respondents’ academic positions (Education Survey)......................................76
Figure 4-2: Respondents’ highest education level (Education Survey).................................77
Figure 4-3: Respondents’ attitudes (Education Survey) towards statement 1......................78
Figure 4-4: Respondents’ attitudes (Education Survey) towards statement 2.......................79
Figure 4-5: A summary of the results of the Education Survey...........................................86
Figure 4-6: Percentage of respondents by employing sector.............................................89
Figure 4-7: Respondents’ work experience years (Industry Survey).................................89
Figure 4-8: Respondents’ highest education level (Industry Survey).................................91
Figure 4-9: The importance and performance level of skills and abilities.........................99
Figure 4-10: Skills and abilities in the IPA matrix: Cross (3.88, 4.26).................................100
Figure 4-11: A summary of the results of the Industry Survey............................................109
Figure 5-1: Gap analysis in tourism curriculum.................................................................125
# LIST OF TABLES

Table 1-1: Tourism industry employment in Australia (1998-2005) ................................................. 3  
Table 1-2: The number of tourism programs in Australia from the 1970s ........................................... 4  
Table 2-1: Tyler's curriculum model ........................................................................................................ 18  
Table 2-2: A brief description of curriculum models ................................................................................ 18  
Table 2-3: The growth of tourism education research .................................................................................. 21  
Table 2-4: Categories of research in tourism education (to 2001) ......................................................... 22  
Table 3-1: Course structures of tourism degrees ....................................................................................... 40  
Table 3-2: A list of 34 areas of study in tourism courses ......................................................................... 42  
Table 3-3: Areas taught in tourism management degrees (Bachelor) ...................................................... 48  
Table 3-4: Orientation of undergraduate tourism degrees ....................................................................... 50  
Table 3-5: Departmental location of undergraduate tourism programs ................................................... 51  
Table 3-6: A list of 27 skills and abilities .................................................................................................. 53  
Table 3-7: The multiple ways of data collection ....................................................................................... 64  
Table 3-8: Tourism employment figures (2003-2005) .............................................................................. 65  
Table 3-9: The employment percentage in the sample of the Industry Survey .......................................... 66  
Table 3-10: Chi-square test of the sample and population ...................................................................... 67  
Table 4-1: Response rate for the Education Survey .................................................................................. 75  
Table 4-2: Attitudes on degrees and curriculum by tourism educators ..................................................... 79  
Table 4-3: Tourism academics’ views on skills and abilities .................................................................. 81  
Table 4-4: Tourism academics’ views on subject areas ........................................................................... 83  
Table 4-5: Response rate of the Industry Survey ..................................................................................... 88  
Table 4-6: Percentage of tourism graduates employed in the tourism industry ...................................... 92  
Table 4-7: Respondents’ attitudes (Industry Survey) towards the statement 1 ......................................... 93  
Table 4-8: Respondents’ attitudes (Industry Survey) towards the statement 2 ......................................... 94  
Table 4-9: Comparison of attitudes between senior and junior management ......................................... 95  
Table 4-10: Tourism managers’ views on skills and abilities ................................................................. 98  
Table 4-11: Perceptions on skills compared between senior and junior management .............................. 103  
Table 4-12: Tourism managers’ views on subjects .................................................................................. 105  
Table 4-13: Comparison of perceptions on subjects between senior and junior management .............. 107  
Table 5-1: Attitudes on tourism degrees and undergraduate curriculum ............................................... 113  
Table 5-2: Importance rating on skills and abilities ranked by tourism industry and academics .......... 116  
Table 5-3: Importance rating on subjects ranked by tourism industry and tourism academics ............. 120  
Table 5-4: Importance ratings on core areas of study .......................................................................... 121
APPENDIXES

Appendix A: University generic skills and tourism specific attributes..............................143
Appendix B: Invitation Email for the Industry Survey..........................................................145
Appendix C: Industry Survey questionnaire.........................................................................147
Appendix D: Invitation Email for the Education Survey.........................................................152
Appendix E: Education Survey questionnaire.......................................................................154
# ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABS</td>
<td>Australian Bureau of Statistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANZSIC</td>
<td>Australian and New Zealand Standard Industrial Classification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAEs</td>
<td>Colleges of Advanced Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEHR</td>
<td>Committee for Ethics in Human Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DITR</td>
<td>Department of Industry, Tourism and Resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HND</td>
<td>Higher National Diploma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPA</td>
<td>Importance-performance analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MICE</td>
<td>Meetings, incentives, and conference &amp; exhibitions tourism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPSS</td>
<td>Statistical Package for the Social Sciences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STCRC</td>
<td>Sustainable Tourism Co-operative Research Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SWIM</td>
<td>Senior Women in Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE-ICE</td>
<td>The International Centre of Excellence in Tourism and Hospitality Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TTF</td>
<td>Tourism and Transport Forum</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>